

INTERNATIONAL PhD IN CRIMINOLOGY

CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF MILAN

XIX CYCLE

**TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS FOR THE PURPOSE OF  
SEXUAL EXPLOITATION AND CORRUPTION IN BRAZIL: AN  
IN-DEPTH ANALYSIS OF THE LINK BETWEEN TWO  
CRIMINAL PHENOMENA**

**ANDREA CIRINEO SACCO**

PhD Candidate

**Doctoral Advisor:** Andrea Di Nicola

**Coordinator:** Ernesto Ugo Savona

“It is the theory that decides what can be observed”

Albert Einstein

To my father, a model of honor and integrity

To my mother, the embodiment of love and faith

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I gratefully thank to the following for their invaluable advice and assistance during the preparation of this thesis. Without their help, much of this work would not have been possible.

Dr. Arinda Fernandes  
Dr. Ernesto Ugo Savona  
Dr. Andrea Di Nicola  
Dr. Jan Klacek  
Drs. Jan Hanousek and Janijava Batlome of the CERGE Institute of Economics in Prague  
Adina Antoine  
Joshua Mensch and Ian Miller, my English advisors

Catholic Univesity of Milan (Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore di Milano)  
Transcrime – Trento  
Ministério Público do Distrito Federal e Territórios  
Federal Police of Brazil  
All respondents to my questionnaire

To Libor Studnicka, my special thanks, for his enduring support and patience

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

### **OVERVIEW OF THE THESIS**

### **ABBREVIATIONS**

### **INDEX OF TERMS**

## **CHAPTER I – INTRODUCTION.....1**

### **1.1 RELEVANCE OF STUDYING THE INTERRELATIONSHIP BETWEEN HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND CORRUPTION .....1**

### **1.2 HUMAN TRAFFICKING: A SOCIAL PROBLEM IN BRAZIL ..... 3**

### **1.3 JUSTIFICATION OF THE STUDY ..... 5**

### **1.4 PURPOSES OF THIS THESIS..... 7**

## **CHAPTER II – LITERATURE REVIEW ON THE LINKAGE BETWEEN THB AND CORRUPTION, RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS AND METHDOLOGY ..... 9**

### **2.1 WORKING DEFINITIONS ..... 9**

#### **2.1.1 Definition of THB..... 9**

#### **2.1.2 Definitions of Corruption ..... 10**

### **2.2 OVERVIEW OF CURRENT SCIENTIFIC LITERATURE ON THE LINKAGE BETWEEN THB AND CORRUPTION ..... 15**

#### **2.2.1 Approach of Corbin Lyday..... 15**

#### **2.2.2 The PACO Networking Approach..... 18**

#### **2.2.3 Approach of Kevin Bales..... 23**

### **2.3 WORKING HYPOTHESIS: THB IS DEPENDENT ON CORRUPTION IN BRAZIL ..... 27**

2.4 METHODOLOGY.....	32
2.4.1 Research Problem: dependence of THB on corruption.....	34
2.4.2 Research Design.....	35
2.4.3 Expected Outcomes.....	38
 <b>CHAPTER III - TESTING THE HYPOTHESIS: EMPIRICAL</b>	
<b>FINDINGS.....</b>	<b>39</b>
 3.1 ISSUES OF CONCERN REGARDING DATA ON THB AND CORRUPTION.....	39
 3.2 FINDINGS FROM THE REPORT OF THE JOINT PARLIAMENTARY COMMISSION OF INQUIRY: DIRECT LINKAGE BETWEEN THB AND CORRUPTION IN BRAZIL.....	43
3.2.1 Report Background and its Relevance .....	43
3.2.2 Secondary Analysis.....	46
3.2.3 THB and Corruption as Directly Interrelated Phenomena.....	48
3.2.4 The Role of Public Officials in THB: types of involvement.....	51
3.2.5 Illustrative Cases of THB-related Corruption.....	53
3.2.6 Analysis of the CPMI by Region.....	57
3.2.7 Summary.....	59
 3.3 FINDINGS FROM THE FEDERAL POLICE: OFFICIAL STATISTICS.....	61
3.3.1 Background and Relevance of the Data Set.....	61
3.3.2 Overall Findings.....	62
3.3.3 Transparency International (TI) and the Corruption Perception Index (CPI).....	64
3.3.4 Regional Analysis.....	68
3.3.5 Summary.....	70
 3.4 FINDINGS FROM THE MUNICIPAL CORRUPTION REPORT.....	71
3.4.1 Background and Relevance of the Data Set.....	71
3.4.2 Overall Findings.....	73
3.4.3 Regional Analysis.....	78
3.4.4 Summary.....	81

3.5 ADVANCED STATISTICAL ANALYSIS: THE DEPENDENCE OF THB ON CORRUPTION IN BRAZIL .....	82
3.5.1 Relationship between THB and Corruption: strength and predictability .....	83
3.5.2 The Impact of Corruption on THB.....	87
3.6 FINDINGS FROM THE SURVEY ON CRIMINAL JUSTICE AGENTS' PERCEPTIONS TOWARDS THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THB AND CORRUPTION IN BRAZIL.....	89
3.6.1 Survey Background.....	89
3.6.2 Characteristics of the Survey and its Methodology.....	90
3.6.3 Characteristics of the Sample.....	93
3.6.4 Complications Identified During Analysis.....	95
3.6.5 Findings Related to THB.....	97
3.6.6 Findings Related to Corruption .....	98
3.6.7 Findings Related to the Relationship between THB and Corruption.....	99
3.6.8 Findings Related to the Trafficking Chain.....	101
3.6.9 Findings Related to the Criminal Justice Chain.....	103
3.6.10 Perceptions of the Efficiency of the Criminal Justice System.....	105
3.6.11 Summary.....	121
 <b>CHAPTER IV – SUMMARY OF RESULTS AND CONCLUSIONS.....</b>	<b>123</b>
4.1 EMPIRICAL SUPPORT FOR THE RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS AND RELATED FINDINGS .....	124
4.2 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY.....	128
4.3 INDICATIONS AND DIRECTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH.....	128
4.4 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS .....	130
4.5 CONCLUSIONS.....	133
 <b>REFERENCES.....</b>	<b>135</b>
 <b>APPENDIX 1: SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE.....</b>	<b>153</b>
 <b>APPENDIX 2: COUNTRY PROFILE.....</b>	<b>163</b>

## **OVERVIEW OF THE THESIS**

This thesis deals with the interrelationship between two criminal phenomena: Trafficking in Human Beings for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation, and Official Corruption in Brazil. The study is based on empirical data from four different sources: three sets of secondary data and a survey.

Chapter I highlights the importance of the study, the problems addressed by the thesis, and its objectives. Chapter II explores up-to-date scientific literature, the working hypothesis, applied methodology, and research design. Chapter III presents the empirical findings of each set of data which shows the dependence of Trafficking in Human Beings on Corruption, the most vulnerable points for corruption during the trafficking and criminal justice chains, regional differences and trends on THB and Corruption in Brazil.

Multivariate analysis is used to highlight the correlation between the two criminal phenomena, the strength of their interrelationship and the predictability. The dependence of Trafficking on Official Corruption is analysed by means of qualitative methods. Chapter IV presents the final conclusions.

## ABBREVIATIONS

<b>CATW</b>	Coalition against Trafficking in Women
<b>CPI</b>	Corruption Perception Index
<b>CPMI</b>	Joint Parliamentary Commission of Inquiry (Comissão Parlamentar Mista de Inquérito)
<b>ECA</b>	Statute for the Child and Adolescent (Estatuto da Criança e do Adolescente)
<b>ECPAT</b>	End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes
<b>ETS</b>	European Treaty Series
<b>EU</b>	European Union
<b>IBGE</b>	Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics (Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística)
<b>INTERPOL</b>	International Police Organization
<b>ILO</b>	International Labor Organization
<b>IOM</b>	International Organization for Migration
<b>IPEA</b>	Institute of Applied Economic Research (Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada)
<b>NGO</b>	Non-Governmental Organization
<b>PACO</b>	Programme against Corruption and Organized Crime in South-Eastern Europe
<b>PESTRAF</b>	National Report on Trafficking in Women, Children and Adolescents for Commercial Sexual Exploitation (Pesquisa sobre Tráfico de Mulheres, Crianças e Adolescentes para fins de Exploração Sexual Comercial)
<b>THB</b>	Trafficking in Human Beings
<b>TI</b>	Transparency International
<b>TIP</b>	Trafficking in Persons Report
<b>UN</b>	United Nations
<b>UNFPA</b>	United Nations Population Fund
<b>UNODC</b>	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
<b>US</b>	United States
<b>USAID</b>	United States Agency for International Development

## INDEX OF TERMS

The term “**federal states**” as it appears in this thesis refers to all federal states in Brazil including the Federal District, unless specified otherwise.

The term “**minor**” as used in this thesis refers to any person under the age of eighteen, according to the definition of “child” in the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child.