LAW ENFORCEMENT AND CRIMINAL NETWORK RESILIENCE: 
THE IMPACT OF LAW ENFORCEMENT ACTION ON THE STRUCTURE OF MAFIA-RELATED DRUG TRAFFICKING NETWORKS

Tesi di dottorato di: Giulia Berlusconi
Matricola: 3911180

Anno Accademico 2012/2013
LAW ENFORCEMENT AND CRIMINAL NETWORK RESILIENCE:
THE IMPACT OF LAW ENFORCEMENT ACTION ON THE STRUCTURE OF MAFIA-RELATED DRUG TRAFFICKING NETWORKS

Coordinatore: Ch.mo Prof. Ernesto U. Savona

Tesi di dottorato di: Giulia Berlusconi
Matricola: 3911180

Anno Accademico 2012/2013
# Table of contents

**ABSTRACT** ................................................................................................................................. 1  
**INTRODUCTION** ......................................................................................................................... 3

**CHAPTER I. THE RESILIENCE OF CRIMINAL ORGANISATIONS** ........................................... 5  
I.1. Law enforcement as a factor in criminal networks evolution ............................................. 5  
I.2. Criminal networks vulnerability ......................................................................................... 7  
I.3. Criminal networks resilience .............................................................................................. 14  
  I.3.1. The elasticity of criminal networks ................................................................................ 18  
  I.3.2. The adaptation of criminal networks ............................................................................ 19  
I.4. Conclusions ......................................................................................................................... 22

**CHAPTER II. ITALIAN MAFIAS: PERSISTENCE AND SURVIVAL** ............................................. 25  
II.1. The distinctive features of Italian mafias ......................................................................... 25  
II.2. The resilience of Italian mafias ......................................................................................... 28  
II.3. The resilient properties of the 'Ndrangheta .................................................................... 32  
II.4. Conclusions and research problem .................................................................................. 35

**CHAPTER III. METHODOLOGY** ................................................................................................. 41  
III.1. The network approach to organised crime ....................................................................... 41  
III.2. Case studies selection ....................................................................................................... 43  
  III.2.1. Operation Cicala ......................................................................................................... 45  
  III.2.2. Operation Stupor Mundi ......................................................................................... 45  
III.3. Data sources ................................................................................................................... 46  
  III.3.1. Data selection and access ......................................................................................... 46  
  III.3.2. Data coding ............................................................................................................... 47  
  III.3.3. Reliability of electronic monitoring data ................................................................... 53  
III.4. Operationalisation of criminal network resilience ............................................................. 55  
III.5. Data analysis .................................................................................................................... 57  
  III.5.1. The quasi-experimental research design .................................................................... 58  
  III.5.2. Analysis of the criminal networks before the arrest ................................................... 60  
  III.5.3. Analysis of the topology and robustness of the criminal networks ............................ 61  
  III.5.4. Analysis of the elasticity of the criminal networks ..................................................... 66  
  III.5.5. Analysis of the adaptation of the criminal networks ................................................ 67  
III.6. Limitations and advantages .............................................................................................. 68  
III.7. Conclusions ....................................................................................................................... 69

**CHAPTER IV. THE CICALA NETWORK** ....................................................................................... 71  
IV.1. The context of control .......................................................................................................... 71  
IV.2. The Cicala network before the arrest ................................................................................ 75  
  IV.2.1. Criminal network topology and robustness ............................................................... 82  
  IV.2.2. The arrest of C3 .......................................................................................................... 85  
IV.3. The impact of the arrest on the Cicala network ................................................................. 87  
  IV.3.1. The elasticity of the Cicala network .......................................................................... 87  
  IV.3.2. The adaptation of the Cicala network ...................................................................... 88  
  IV.3.3. Evolution of communication methods ...................................................................... 97
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.4. Evolution of drug trafficking activities</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.5. Evolution of protection methods against law enforcement surveillance</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.4. Conclusions</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER V. THE STUPOR MUNDI NETWORK</strong></td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.1. The context of control</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.2. The Stupor Mundi network before the arrests</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.2.1. Criminal network topology and robustness</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.2.2. The arrest of S21 and S22</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3. The impact of the arrests on the Stupor Mundi network</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3.1. The elasticity of the Stupor Mundi network</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3.2. The adaptation of the Stupor Mundi network</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3.3. Evolution of communication methods</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3.4. Evolution of drug trafficking activities</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3.5. Evolution of protection methods against law enforcement surveillance</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.4. Conclusions</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER VI. DISCUSSION</strong></td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of tables

Table III.1 Selected case studies ........................................................................................................ 44
Table III.2 Sources of data .................................................................................................................. 46
Table III.3 Descriptive statistics of the criminal networks .................................................................. 60
Table III.4 Statistics for the identification of small-world properties .................................................. 63
Table III.5 Statistics for the identification of scale-free properties ..................................................... 64
Table IV.1 Investigative phases of Operation Cicala ........................................................................... 74
Table IV.2 Descriptive statistics of the Cicala network ....................................................................... 75
Table IV.3 Degree and betweenness centrality for each actor in the Cicala network ......................... 78
Table IV.4 Division of tasks within the Cicala network ...................................................................... 79
Table IV.5 Role and status of actors in the Cicala network .................................................................. 80
Table IV.6 Small-world properties of the Cicala network before the arrest ........................................ 82
Table IV.7 Scale-free properties of the Cicala network before the arrest ............................................ 83
Table IV.8 Changes across the phases of the investigation ................................................................. 88
Table IV.9 Descriptive statistics of the Cicala network in the three investigative phases.................. 89
Table IV.10 Degree centrality for the top 10 actors in the three investigative phases ............................ 91
Table IV.11 Betweenness centrality for the top 10 actors in the three investigative phases ............... 91
Table IV.12 Conversations and meetings across investigative phases ................................................ 98
Table V.1 Investigative phases of Operation Stupor Mundi ............................................................... 106
Table V.2 Descriptive statistics of the Stupor Mundi network ............................................................. 106
Table V.3 Changes across phase networks ......................................................................................... 107
Table V.4 Degree and betweenness centrality for each actor in the Stupor Mundi network ............... 109
Table V.5 Division of tasks within the Stupor Mundi network ............................................................. 110
Table V.6 Role and status of the actors in the Stupor Mundi network ................................................ 111
Table V.7 Small-world properties of the Stupor Mundi network before the arrest ............................ 113
Table V.8 Scale-free properties of the Stupor Mundi network before the arrest ............................... 114
Table V.9 Individual positions within the Stupor Mundi network before the arrest .............. 117
Table V.10 Changes across the phase networks .............................................................. 120
Table V.11 Descriptive statistics of the Stupor Mundi network in the four investigative phases ........................................................................................................................................................................... 120
Table V.12 Degree centrality for the top 10 actors in the four investigative phases .......... 122
Table V.13 Betweenness centrality for the top 10 actors in the four investigative phases .. 122
Table V.14 Conversations and meetings during the four investigative phases ................. 129
List of figures

Figure I.1 Ball and cup heuristic of system stability .......................................................... 15
Figure III.1 Operationalisation of resilience ........................................................................... 56
Figure IV.1 Wiretapped persons and telephone lines over time ........................................... 72
Figure IV.2 Wiretapped telephone calls and meetings over time .......................................... 73
Figure IV.3 Average degree of criminal networks in the literature ...................................... 76
Figure IV.4 Degree and betweenness centralisation of criminal networks in the literature ... 77
Figure IV.5 Task, status and role of each actor in the Cicala network. Node size by betweenness centrality ........................................................................................................... 81
Figure IV.6 Cumulative degree distribution for the Cicala network before the arrest .......... 83
Figure IV.7 Sequences of node failure and robustness plot of the Cicala network ............... 84
Figure IV.8 The position of C3 within the Cicala network ..................................................... 86
Figure IV.9 Changes in the structure of Cicala network over time ........................................ 87
Figure IV.10 Degree and betweenness centralisation of the Cicala network in the three investigative phases ......................................................................................................................... 89
Figure IV.11 Division of tasks within the Cicala network in the three investigative phases ... 93
Figure IV.12 Roles of actors in the Cicala network in the three investigative phases .......... 94
Figure IV.13 Task, role and location of each actor in the Cicala network at P1 ..................... 95
Figure IV.14 Task, role and location of each actor in the Cicala network at P2 ..................... 96
Figure IV.15 Task, role and location of each actor in the Cicala network at P3 ..................... 97
Figure IV.16 Topics of conversation across the investigative phases .................................... 99
Figure V.1 Wiretapped persons and telephone lines over time ........................................... 104
Figure V.2 Wiretapped telephone calls and meetings over time ........................................... 105
Figure V.3 Average degree of criminal networks in the literature ....................................... 108
Figure V.4 Degree and betweenness centralisation of criminal networks in the literature .. 108
Figure V.5 Task, status and role of each actor in the Stupor Mundi network. Node size by betweenness centrality

Figure V.6 Cumulative degree distribution for the Stupor Mundi network before the arrest

Figure V.7 Sequences of node failure and robustness plot of the Stupor Mundi network

Figure V.8 The position of S21 within the Stupor Mundi network at P2

Figure V.9 The position of S22 within the Stupor Mundi network at P3

Figure V.10 Changes in the structure of the Stupor Mundi network over time

Figure V.11 Degree and betweenness centralisation of the Stupor Mundi network in the four investigative phases

Figure V.12 Division of tasks within the Stupor Mundi network in the four investigative phases

Figure V.13 Roles of actors in the Stupor Mundi network in the four investigative phases

Figure V.14 Task, role and location of each actor in the Stupor Mundi network at P1

Figure V.15 Task, role and location of each actor in the Stupor Mundi network at P2

Figure V.16 Task, role and location of each actor in the Stupor Mundi network at P3

Figure V.17 Task, role and location of each actor in the Stupor Mundi network at P4

Figure V.18 Topics of conversation during the four investigative phases
ABSTRACT

To understand mafia persistence over time and address the problem of the impact of law enforcement interventions on criminal groups, some scholars have introduced the concept of resilience into organized crime research; this refers to the ability of criminal groups to deal with ongoing changes and reorganize themselves accordingly.

Adopting a network approach to organized crime and drawing on previous studies on criminal network resilience, this study analyses the evolution of two ‘Ndrangheta criminal groups over around two years, seeking to understand how they adapted to the external pressure of law enforcement agencies, and to identify the mechanisms that drove their evolution and the structural changes that they experienced.

The results show that the two mafia groups had several sources of resilience. The possibility to rely on non-economic ties, which are not the consequence of their participation in illegal markets, enabled the mafia groups to rapidly, though partially, replace the actors arrested. A less prominent role of the formal hierarchy of the ‘Ndrangheta in criminal networks mainly involved in drug trafficking instead gave rise to a more flexible internal configuration.