- Table of Contents -

Acknowledgements p. i
Table of common abbreviations iii

Introduction p. 1
Research Design 11
i. Overview 11
ii. Methodology 12
iii. Structure and aim of the study 14

PART ONE

Chapter I - Understanding the phenomenon p. 19
1. Learning from criminology 19
2. A look to the world: global (food) supply chains and exploitation 20
   I. Food supply chains: a clarification 21
   II. The growth of supermarkets chains as ‘food authorities’ 21
   III. Extensive subcontracting chains offering fertile conditions for exploitation 22
   IV. Paradigmatic cases across the globe 23
      i. Child labour in cocoa production in Ghana and Ivory Coast 24
      ii. Forced labour in the Thai shrimps industry 25
      iii. Refugees’ exploitation in olive cultivation in Turkey 26
3. Labour exploitation in the agri-food sector across Europe 27
   I. Evidence about labour exploitation abounds 28
   II. Trafficking cases for labour exploitation 30
4. The job market in the Italian agriculture and food production 33
   I. Looking for up-to-date numbers 34
   II. Relevant actors 36
   III. High rate of irregularities 37
      i. The (illegal) gangmaster system 37
      ii. Landless cooperatives and international employment agencies 39
      iii. The expansion of voucher use 40
   IV. Agromafia: the nexus between the agro-food sector and mafia-type organisations 41
5. Italian case studies 44
   I. The Rosarno riot: the tip of the iceberg 46
   II. The strike of Nardò: an isolated case of migrants’ self-organization 48
III. Romanian women in Sicily: multiple exploitation?  
IV. Sikh in the Latina area: a community of merely hands  
V. North of Italy: exploitation also in the ‘quality food’ product chains  
6. The media coverage: the rise of ‘modern slavery’  
7. The way of production: capturing trends  
   I. The continuum of exploitation: between decent work and forced labour  
   II. Precariousness, vulnerability and exploitation: peculiarities of the sector?  
   III. A close (but not exclusive) relationship between migration and exploitation  
8. Who are the victims?  
9. Snapshot of (notoriously unreliable) data

PART TWO

Chapter II - The current legal framework: international and regional levels  
1. Setting the stage: the current intertwined system of sources of law  
2. The international context  
   I. The first definition of slavery: a property law paradigm  
   II. The ILO concept of forced labour: a call to action  
   III. Trafficking: a tiny part of the global problem  
3. Regional levels  
   A. The Council of Europe: a human rights perspective  
      I. Article 4 ECHR as interpreted by the European Court  
      II. CoE Trafficking Convention: balancing human rights and prosecution reasons  
   B. The European Union: an area of freedom, security and justice  
      I. Directive 2011/36/EU: building further on international standards  
      II. Short-term permits to protect trafficking victims: an opportunistic approach?  
      III. Is irregular immigration fostering exploitation? Acting against the employment pull factor  
      IV. A level playing field for (new) seasonal workers  
   V. Towards victims’ protection  
   VI. Compensation to crime victims  
   VII. Labour exploitation in a nutshell  
   C. The Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe: soft language, strong efforts  
4. Agreed legal definitions at the international and regional levels

Chapter III - The current legal framework: the case of Italy
1. An overview of the domestic legislation  
2. Sanctions: from undeclared work to the most serious forms of exploitation  
   A. Violations of administrative law  
      I. A maxi-sanction for undeclared work

PART TWO

Chapter II - The current legal framework: international and regional levels  
1. Setting the stage: the current intertwined system of sources of law  
2. The international context  
   I. The first definition of slavery: a property law paradigm  
   II. The ILO concept of forced labour: a call to action  
   III. Trafficking: a tiny part of the global problem  
3. Regional levels  
   A. The Council of Europe: a human rights perspective  
      I. Article 4 ECHR as interpreted by the European Court  
      II. CoE Trafficking Convention: balancing human rights and prosecution reasons  
   B. The European Union: an area of freedom, security and justice  
      I. Directive 2011/36/EU: building further on international standards  
      II. Short-term permits to protect trafficking victims: an opportunistic approach?  
      III. Is irregular immigration fostering exploitation? Acting against the employment pull factor  
      IV. A level playing field for (new) seasonal workers  
   V. Towards victims’ protection  
   VI. Compensation to crime victims  
   VII. Labour exploitation in a nutshell  
   C. The Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe: soft language, strong efforts  
4. Agreed legal definitions at the international and regional levels

Chapter III - The current legal framework: the case of Italy
1. An overview of the domestic legislation  
2. Sanctions: from undeclared work to the most serious forms of exploitation  
   A. Violations of administrative law  
      I. A maxi-sanction for undeclared work
II. Suspension of the business activity

B. Criminal offences

I. Employment and exploitation of illegally staying third-country nationals
   i. Prohibition of illegal employment
   ii. Employment of illegally staying third-country nationals or aiding and abetting of illegal immigration?
   iii. The aggravating circumstance for exploitation
   iv. Null contract but valid effects to protect the worker

II. The so-called caporalato provision

III. Maltreatment of family members or cohabitants

IV. Association for purposes of committing crimes under Articles 600, 601 and 602 CC.

V. Violence or threats, coercion and unjust profit: is there extortion?

VI. Reducing or holding a person in a condition of slavery or servitude: the most serious forms of labour exploitation

VII. Trafficking in persons: towards a single definition

VIII. Purchase and sale of slaves: a residual provision

3. Irregular migration and victims of exploitation

I. Irregular migration and the Union

II. The Italian case

III. Is Article 10 bis a risk factor to exploitation?

IV. Law No. 67/2014: what happened to Article 10 bis?

V. A proposed interpretation to respect, protect, and fulfil the human rights of all persons

4. Victims’ protection

I. The Italian model to protect the victims of exploitation
   A. Article 13, Law No. 228/2003: short-term assistance for victims of slavery and trafficking
   B. Article 18, Consolidated Immigration Act: long-term assistance for victims of severe exploitation
   C. The single programme of emergence, assistance and social integration

II. The rationale for unconditional protection

III. System actions on trafficking

IV. Legislative Decree No. 24/2014: fully implementing Directive 2011/36/EU?

V. What kind of compensation and for whom?

VI. The Italian Action Plan against trafficking

5. An effective criminal justice system

PART THREE

Chapter IV - In search of a preventive strategy

1. Key principles and standards
I. An integrated human rights-based approach for all subject involved

II. All workers shall be treated equally and without discrimination

III. Taking care of victims
   i. Overcoming a stereotypical perception of victims
   ii. Links between the protection of victims of trafficking and asylum procedures
   iii. Widening protection to all victims of exploitation

2. Labour exploitation as corporate crime
   I. What is ‘corporate crime’?
   II. Corporate liability for ‘labour exploitation’ in Italy

3. Building on existing experiences
   I. Business and Human Rights
      i. A closer look at the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights
         a. The State’s (legal) duty to protect
         b. The corporate responsibility to respect: the concept of due diligence
         c. Access to effective remedy
      ii. General international human rights standards for businesses
         a. ILO Multinational Enterprises Declaration
         b. OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises
         c. UN Global Compact
         d. GRI - G4 Guidelines
         e. ISO 26000
   II. ‘Good laws’
      i. Chain liability to protect workers’ rights in subcontracting: Netherlands (and Italy)
      ii. The Brazilian ‘dirty list’
      iii. California Transparency in Supply Chains Act
      iv. Section 54 of the UK Modern Slavery Act
   III. Good practices
      i. Proactive measures
      ii. Measures promoting cooperation
      iii. Measures aiming at restorative outcomes in a broad sense
   IV. Learning from inadequate solutions

3. A ‘responsive’ strategy
   I. Understanding responsive regulation
      i. The regulatory pyramid
      ii. Tripartitism
      iii. A process-approach to compliance
   II. Towards a principle-based framework
   III. A regulatory pyramid for fighting labour exploitation in the agri-food sector
      i. Education and persuasion
ii. Mandated self-regulation 254
   a. Transparency legislations 254
      i. Disclosure requirements 255
      ii. Due diligence obligations 258
   b. Regulation of market mechanisms 260
      iii. Administrative sanctions with ‘corporate probation’ 261
      iv. Criminal law provisions 263
5. Is there room for restorative justice? 264

Final remarks  p. 269

Annex I
Gli illeciti in materia di sfruttamento lavorativo nell’ordinamento italiano  p. 273

REFERENCES
Bibliographical References 332
International legal resources and related documents (reasoned) 399
Regional legal resources and related documents (reasoned) 403
Main national legal resources (Italy) 408
Case law 410
Press 412